# A Tutorial of AMPL for Linear Programming 

Hongwei Jin

May, 2014

## Contents

1 Introduction ..... 1
1.1 AMPL ..... 1
1.2 Solvers ..... 2
1.3 Install and Run ..... 4
2 AMPL Syntax ..... 5
2.1 Model Declaration ..... 5
2.2 Data Assignment ..... 9
2.3 Solve ..... 10
2.4 Display ..... 10
2.5 Advanced AMPL Feature ..... 12
3 Example: Capacity Expansion Problem ..... 13
3.1 Problem Definition ..... 13
3.2 Model Definition ..... 15
3.3 Transfer into AMPL ..... 16
4 Summarization ..... 17
Reference ..... 18

## 1 Introduction

### 1.1 AMPL

AMPL is a comprehensive and powerful algebraic modeling language for linear and nonlinear optimization problems, in discrete or continuous variables. Developed at Bell Laboratories, AMPL lets you use common notation and familiar concepts to formulate optimization models and examine solutions, while the computer manages communication with an appropriate solver. AMPL's flexibility and convenience render it ideal for rapid prototyping and model development, while its speed and control options make it an especially efficient choice for repeated production runs.

According to the statistics of NEOS [1], AMPL is the most commonly used mathematical modeling language submitted to the server.


Figure 1: NEOS statistics
Let's first take a simplest example using AMPL to solve a linear optimization problem.
Assume we have a problem, which is Example 1.1 in our textbook:

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \min \quad 2 x_{1}-x_{2}+4 x_{3} \\
& \text { s.t. } \quad x_{1}+x_{2}+x_{4} \leq 2 \\
& 3 x_{2}-x_{3}=5 \\
& x_{3}+x_{4} \geq 3 \\
& x_{1} \geq 0 \\
& x_{3} \leq 0
\end{aligned}
$$

We can transfer such problem into AMPL like the following:

## Simple Example

```
ampl: var x1; # variables
ampl: var x2;
ampl: var x3;
ampl: var x4;
ampl: minimize cost: 2*x1 - x2 + 4*x3; # problem
ampl: subject to con1: x1 + x2 + x4 <= 2; # constriants
ampl: subject to con2: 3*x2 - x3 = 5;
ampl: subject to con3: x3 + x4 >= 3;
ampl: subject to con4: x1 >= 0;
ampl: subject to con5: x3 <= 0;
ampl: solve; # solve problem
MINOS 5.5: infeasible problem.
O iterations
```

AMPL describes the problem and uses MINOS to solve the problem. However, it is a infeasible problem detected by solver. I will discuss the details of the problem in the following of the report.

### 1.2 Solvers

A solver is an application which really solves the problem, and achieves its result. There are many solvers working with AMPL. AMPL takes MINOS as its default solver, and of course, if you want to change the solver, you may put solver option in command.

```
ampl: option solver; # display current solver
option solver minos;
ampl: option solver CPLEX; # change to CPLEX
ampl: option solver;
option solver CPLEX;
```

As we all know, there are many algorithms approaching solving problems. Here is a list of algorithms commonly used in solvers [2] for different type of problems.

- Linear (simplex): Linear objective and constraints, by some version of the simplex method.
- Linear (interior): Linear objective and constraints, by some version of an interior (or barrier) method.
- Network: Linear objective and network flow constraints, by some version of the network simplex method.
- Quadratic: Convex or concave quadratic objective and linear constraints, by either a simplextype or interior-type method.
- Nonlinear: Continuous but not all-linear objective and constraints, by any of several methods including reduced gradient, quasi-newton, augmented Lagrangian and interior-point. Unless other indication is given (see below), possibly optimal over only some local neighborhood.
- Nonlinear convex: Nonlinear with an objective that is convex (if minimized) or concave (if maximized) and constraints that define a convex region. Guaranteed to be optimal over the entire feasible region.
- Nonlinear global: Nonlinear but requiring a solution that is optimal over all points in the feasible region.
- Complementarity: Linear or nonlinear as above, with additional complementarity conditions.
- Integer linear: Linear objective and constraints and some or all integer-valued variables, by a branch-and-bound approach that applies a linear solver to successive subproblems.
- Integer nonlinear: Continuous but not all-linear objective and constraints and some or all integer-valued variables, by a branch-and-bound approach that applies a nonlinear solver to successive subproblems.

Different solvers have their own feature, some may mainly focus on linear optimization, some may suitable for solving non-linear optimization problem, which depend on the complex algorithms implemented inside them.

Here are some commonly used solver compatible with AMPL:

- CPLEX: The IBM ILOG CPLEX Optimizer solves integer programming problems, very large linear programming problems using either primal or dual variants of the simplex method or the barrier interior point method, convex and non-convex quadratic programming problems, and convex quadratically constrained problems (solved via second-order cone programming, or SOCP).
- MINOS: MINOS is a software package for solving large-scale optimization problems (linear and nonlinear programs). It is especially effective for linear programs and for problems with a nonlinear objective function and sparse linear constraints (e.g., quadratic programs).
- Gurobi: The Gurobi Optimizer is a state-of-the-art solver for mathematical programming. It includes the following solvers: linear programming solver (LP), quadratic programming solver (QP), quadratically constrained programming solver (QCP), mixed-integer linear programming solver (MILP), mixed-integer quadratic programming solver (MIQP), and mixed-integer quadratically constrained programming solver (MIQCP). The solvers in the Gurobi Optimizer were designed from the ground up to exploit modern architectures and multi-core processors, using the most advanced implementations of the latest algorithms.
- CLP/CBC: CLP(COIN-OR LP) is an open-source linear programming solver written in C++. It is published under the Common Public License so it can be used in commercial software without any of the contamination issues of the GNU General Public License. CLP
is primarily meant to be used as a callable library, although a stand-alone executable version can be built. It is designed to be as reliable as any commercial solver (if not quite as fast) and to be able to tackle very large problems.
- SNOPT: SNOPT is for the solution of nonlinearly constrained optimization problems. SNOPT is suitable for large nonlinearly constrained problems with a modest number of degrees of freedom. SNOPT implements a sequential programming algorithm that uses a smooth augmented Lagrangian merit function and makes explicit provision for infeasibility in the original problem and in the quadratic programming subproblems.
- KNITRO: KNITRO is for the solution of general non-convex, nonlinearly constrained optimization problems. KNITRO can also be effectively used to solve simpler classes of problems such as unconstrained problems, bound constrained problems, linear programs (LPs) and quadratic programs (QPs). KNITRO offers both interior-point and active-set methods.

In Table 1 summarize all commonly used solver for different optimization problems.
Table 1: Solver for problem types

|  | LP | MILP | QP | MIQP | NLP | MINLP |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| CPLEX | $*$ | $*$ | $*$ | $*$ |  |  |
| MINOS | $*$ | $*$ | $*$ | $*$ | $*$ | $*$ |
| Gurobi | $*$ | $*$ | $*$ | $*$ |  |  |
| CLP/CBC | $*$ | $*$ | $*$ | $*$ |  |  |
| SNOPT | $*$ | $*$ | $*$ | $*$ | $*$ | $*$ |
| KNITRO | $*$ | $*$ | $*$ | $*$ | $*$ | $*$ |
| lpsolve | $*$ | $*$ |  |  |  |  |

In this report, it applies CPLEX as its default solver.

### 1.3 Install and Run

Notice AMPL and some other solvers are for commercial usage. However, they also provide a student version, for whom working on AMPL and other solvers to do coursework or simple research project.

One from AMPL:
http://www. ampl.com/DOWNLOADS/.
Choose the compatible version to download, meanwhile, it is recommended to download some student version of solvers working with AMPL. A much easy and useful link
http://ampl.com/try-ampl/download-a-demo-version/
contains both AMPL, solver and examples. If you want to run those examples, you need to use command line to locate your directory and type in the following command:

```
$ ampl modinc -
```

This will include all the files in the EXAMPLES and MODELS directories, such that you can include those files without change directory. Also for the convenience of changing workspace, recommended to add the $\mathbf{a m p l}$ and solvers into system PATH.

Another source is from netlib: http://www.netlib.org/ampl/student/, which is repository of mathematical softwares. Size-limited versions of AMPL and certain solvers are available free for download from this page. These versions have no licensing requirements or expiration date. However they are strictly limited in the size of problem that can be sent to a solver:

- For linear problems, 500 variables and 500 constraints plus objectives.
- For nonlinear problems, 300 variables and 300 constraints plus objectives.

A online demo can also apply AMPL and other solvers to solve problems build with AMPL. The AMPL [3] also provide a free "cloud" optimization service that makes AMPL and many solvers available for trial through an online scheduler and contributed workstations at various locations. The online version also has size limitations.

After setting up all the environment, you can try the simplex example at the beginning of the report. If you get the same result as showed before, you can continue to next part. Otherwise, you need to be carefully to set up the environment.

You can refer to the Appendix 1, it will help you to set the AMPL working step by step, also it will give you example of running AMPL and GLPK ${ }^{1}$ on Linux system as well.

## 2 AMPL Syntax

Typically, a complete AMPL program will contain three parts: model(.mod file), data(.dat file) and running command(.run file). Model is a description of the mathematical model, it will include variables, parameters, objective function, constraints etc. Data is a specific set of exact data used in the model, mostly, it is for parameters defined in the model. Running command is to integrate both model and data file into the command, and also set proper options of AMPL and solver, display the result.

### 2.1 Model Declaration

In AMPL command, you can start model declaration in the following way:

```
ampl: model;
ampl: set N;
ampl: param distance {i in N};
ampl: var x {i in N} >=O;
```

[^0]```
ampl: minimize cost: sum {i in N} x[i];
ampl: s.t. c1 {i in N}: x[i] >=distance[i];
...
ampl: # or simply import a .mod file
ampl: model dis.mod;
```

where \# sign is for a comment line. Now we will go through all the parts of a mathematical model declarations.

Table 2: set examples

| mod FILE | .dat FILE |
| :--- | :--- |
| param $\mathrm{n} ;$ <br> set $\mathrm{P}:=1 . . \mathrm{n} ;$ | param $\mathrm{n}:=4 ;$ |
| set $\mathrm{Q} ;$ | set Q:=1234; |
| set $\mathrm{R} ;$ | set R $:=$ rainy, cloudy, sunny; |
| param $\mathrm{t} ;$ <br> set $\mathrm{T}:=1 . . \mathrm{t} ;$ | param $\mathrm{t}:=1000 ;$ |
| set $\mathrm{U}\{\mathrm{T}\}$ default $\} ;$ |  |

## SET

In AMPL, set is a keyword used to define finite collections of elements. These elements can be numerical or non-numerical, and frequently are used as indices. Table 2 gives some examples of set declarations in model(.mod) file and assignments of value(.dat) file.

In the last example, we used the statement default follow by $\}$. This means, that after defining the set $U$, whose elements are indexed by the set $T$, we state that $U$ starts empty.

## PARAM

Typically, in a mathematical model, parameters are important to it. Most of the analyses of model are focus on parameters. In AMPL, it use param to declare parameters. The parameter entity is used to hold constant values. Table 3 shows some examples of parameter declarations (.mod file) and the corresponding assignment of values (.run file).

Table 3: param example

| .mod FILE | .dat FILE |
| :---: | :---: |
| param m1; | param m1 := 11.221 .531 .4 ; |
| param m2; | $\begin{aligned} & \text { param m2 := } \\ & 11.2 \\ & 21.5 \\ & 31.4 ; \end{aligned}$ |
| $\begin{aligned} & \text { set } \mathrm{M} \text {; } \\ & \text { set } 0 ; \\ & \text { param } \mathrm{p}\{\mathrm{M}, \mathrm{O}\} ; \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { set } \mathrm{M}:=\mathrm{a} \text { b c d; } \\ & \text { set } \mathrm{O}:=\text { e f } \mathrm{g} \text {; } \\ & \text { param p: } \\ & \quad \text { a b c d }:= \\ & \text { e } 1532 \\ & \text { f } 4310 \\ & \text { g } 3278 \text {; } \end{aligned}$ |
| $\begin{aligned} & \text { param } \mathrm{n} ; \\ & \text { set } \mathrm{M} ; \\ & \text { set } 0 ; \\ & \text { set } \mathrm{N} ; \\ & \text { param } \mathrm{q}\{\mathrm{M}, \mathrm{O}, \mathrm{~N}\} ; \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { param } \mathrm{n}:=3 ; \\ & \text { set } \mathrm{M}:=\mathrm{a} \mathrm{~b} \mathrm{c} \mathrm{d;} \\ & \text { set } \mathrm{O}:=\mathrm{e} \mathrm{f} \mathrm{g;} \\ & \text { set } \mathrm{N}:=\{1 . . \mathrm{n}\} ; \\ & \text { param q: } \\ & {\left[{ }^{*}, *, 1\right]: \text { a b c d }:=} \\ & \quad \text { e } 3010810 \\ & \quad \text { f } 227107 \\ & \quad \text { g } 19111210 \end{aligned}$ |

In general, parameters can be indexed with Cartesian product of sets. Which we can use cost to declare that.

## VAR

Variables are the fundamental stuff we need to solve in a mathematical model. AMPL uses var as its keyword to declare variables. Variables are the AMPL entities representing the actual variables in our mathematical program. We can illustrate the declaration of variables in a .mod file (you can also do this in a .run file) through examples. Table 4 shows some examples of var declaration.

Table 4: var example

| .mod file |
| :--- |
| var $\mathrm{x} ;$ |
| var $\mathrm{x}\{\mathrm{N}\} ;$ |
| var $\mathrm{x}\{1 . . \mathrm{n}\}>=0<=1 ;$ |
| var $\mathrm{x}\{1 . . \mathrm{n}, \mathrm{M}\}$ integer; |
| var $\mathrm{x}\{\mathrm{M}, \mathrm{O}, \mathrm{N}\}$ binary; |

Notice all the declarations are in. $\bmod$ files. Bound constraints over the variables can be imposed in the declaration of the variables in the $\bmod$ file. In the third example in Table 4 we imposed upper and lower bounds over the vector of variables x during the declaration of the variables.

Also by default the variables are assumed to be real numbers, if your problem requires that a variable or vector of variables is restricted to be integer or binary you should write the command integer or binary in front the declaration of the variable. Just like the last two examples in Table 4. Again, variables can be indexed with Cartesian product of sets.

## MAXIMIZE / MINIMIZE

The objective function is what we want to minimize or maximize. In AMPL, it applies keyword minimize and maximize to set the objective function. Following with minimize or maximize, you should also to define a name of the objective function, such as cost, profit. Then to write down the formula of the objective. Table 5 shows some examples.

Table 5: minimize/maximize example
.mod file
maximize profit: sum $\{\mathrm{i}$ in Index $\} \mathrm{x}[\mathrm{i}] *$ profit $[\mathrm{i}]$;
minimize cost: sum $\{\mathrm{i}$ in Index $\} \mathrm{x}[\mathrm{i}]$;
maximize profit : sum \{i in Index\} x[i] * profit[i];

As showed above, we can use sum \{i in Index \} to indicate a summation of variables. Besides that, in AMPL, you can define multiple objectives, it will automatically consider two objective functions.

## SUBJECT TO

A mathematical modeling will have some constraints, in AMPL, it uses subject to or simply s.t. to indicate a constraint. like define an objective function, you should also name each constraint as well. Table 6 shows some example of constraint declaration.

Table 6: subject to/s.t. example
.mod file

```
subject to constA \(\{\mathrm{i}\) in \(1 . . \mathrm{n}\}: \mathrm{x}[\mathrm{i}]<=\mathrm{b}[\mathrm{i}]\);
subject to constB \(\{\mathrm{i}\) in N\(\}: \mathrm{x}\left[\mathrm{i},{ }^{\prime} \mathrm{a}^{\prime}\right]+\mathrm{x}\left[\mathrm{i},{ }^{\prime} \mathrm{b} '\right]<=c[\mathrm{i}]\);
    s.t. add ConstC l in MAXCONST : card(CONST4[1]) \(<>0\) :
        \(\mathrm{I} 4[1,1]^{*} \mathrm{bx}[1]+\mathrm{I} 4[1,2]^{*}(1\)-bys \([1])<=\mathrm{I} 4[1,3]+\mathrm{I} 4[1,4]^{*} \mathrm{ly}[1] ;\)
```

It is quite useful, since you don't need to define a list of constraints, you only need to define a specific pattern of constraints, generally in your model have constraints have $\forall i$. This kind of statements are very useful when you want to add new constraints to a problem in an automatic way depending on some previous results. For example in an integer programming problem you want to add some valid inequalities to cut your feasible region given than the solution of our LP relaxation is not integer. It is suggested that if your variable have its upper or lower bound, specify it in the var part, rather than put it in the constraint part.

### 2.2 Data Assignment

In AMPL command line, you can type like the following to assign data to set and param

```
ampl: model dietu.mod;
ampl: data;
ampl data: set MINREQ := A B1 B2 C CAL;
ampl data: set MAXREQ := A NA CAL;
...
ampl: # import data specification from a . dat file:
ampl: data dietu.dat;
```

It is straight forward, however, sometimes you need to specify a large data, for example a time sequence. You can use " $\}$ " to indicate a list:

```
ampl: set TIME := {1..100}
```

which means a time sequence from 1 to 100 , increasing 1 at a time.
Also mostly a two-dimension set or parameter are needed. AMPL has a gentle feature to handle such problem. One option is to specify two dimension data as a list of pairs.

```
ampl data: set LINKS :=
(GARY,DET) (GARY,LAN) (GARY,STL) (GARY,LAF) (CLEV,FRA)
(CLEV,DET) (CLEV,LAN) (CLEV,WIN) (CLEV,STL) (CLEV,LAF)
(PITT,FRA) (PITT,WIN) (PITT,STL) (PITT,FRE) ;
```

Another option is to specify it with $*$ taking the place of elements which can be replaced with others.

```
ampl data: set LINKS :=
```

```
(*,FRA) CLEV PITT (*,DET) GARY CLEV (*,LAN) GARY CLEV
(*,WIN) CLEV PITT (*,LAF) GARY CLEV (*,FRE) PITT
(*,STL) GARY CLEV PITT ;
```

Such kind of feature is much more useful in a situation with sparse matrix data. And also for high dimension data, which is much larger than 2 , you can take the advantage of it.

### 2.3 Solve

After setting up all the model and data, you need to run command to solve problem.

```
ampl: model diet.mod;
ampl: data diet.dat;
ampl: solve;
MINOS 5.5: optimal solution found.
6 iterations, objective 88.2
```

It will output some basic result. If the problem is infeasible or unbounded, the solver will also output some information, just like the example showed at the beginning.

AMPL use MINOS as its default solver, if you want to change it to CPLEX, you can type like the following:

```
ampl: model diet.mod;
ampl: data diet.dat;
ampl: option solver cplex;
ampl: solve;
CPLEX 12.6.0.0: optimal solution; objective 88.2
1 dual simplex iterations (O in phase I)
```

Different solver will have different algorithms to apply, the output may have some differences.

### 2.4 Display

Now you can get the model solved, and you want to know what is the optimal solution, display command can display some detailed information of the result.

```
ampl: # Print out the value of the objective function
ampl: display _objname, _obj;
: _objname _obj :=
1 Total_Cost 88.2
;
ampl: # print out by obj name
ampl: display Total_Cost;
Total_Cost = 88.2
ampl: # Print out names, values and reduced costs
ampl: display _varname, _var, _var.rc;
    _varname _var _var.rc :=
1 "Buy['BEEF']" 0 1.3
```

```
2 "Buy['CHK']" 0 0.07
"Buy['FISH']" 0 1.03
4 "Buy['HAM']" 0 1.63
5 "Buy['MCH']" 46.6667 -2.22045e-16
6 "Buy['MTL']" 0}0.
7 "Buy['SPG']" 0 0.1
8 "Buy['TUR']" 0 1.23
;
ampl: # print out by variable name
ampl: display Buy;
Buy [*] :=
BEEF 0
    CHK 0
FISH 0
    HAM 0
    MCH 46.6667
    MTL 0
    SPG 0
    TUR 0
;
ampl: # print out constriant name, lower bound, upper bound, and its dual.
ampl: display _conname,_con.lb,_con.ub, _con.dual;
: _conname _con.lb _con.ub _con.dual :=
    "Diet['A']" 700 10000 0
    "Diet['B1']" 700 10000 0
    "Diet['B2']" 700 10000 0.126
    "Diet['C']" 700 10000 0
```

It is much flexible of display options. Generic synonyms such as _obj, _var, _con is enough for us to get the solution. If an analysis based on the optimal solution, you may need to add some suffix to show much more of the result, lower bound(.lb), upper bound(.ub), reduced cost(.rc) and so on.

If you want to save the result into a file, you can use " $>$ " to a specific file. Foe every model solve, it will replace the data inside it, unless you set a sequence of problems to solve using for or repeat. For example:

```
ampl: model diet.mod;
ampl: data diet.dat;
ampl: solve;
ampl: display _obj > diet.out;
ampl: display _varname, _var > diet.out;
```

And in the file diet.out, we will have:

```
_obj [*] :=
1 88.2
;
```

```
    _varname _var :=
    "Buy['BEEF']" 0
    "Buy['CHK']" 0
    "Buy['FISH']" 0
    "Buy['HAM'] " 0
    "Buy ['MCH']" 46.6667
    "Buy['MTL']" -1.07823e-16
    "Buy['SPG']" -1.32893e-16
    "Buy['TUR']" 0
```


### 2.5 Advanced AMPL Feature

## FOR / REPEAT

In some model, you will repeat the model again with modifying some parameters, thus a loop command is useful in such situations. These are looping commands to repeatedly perform tasks until some condition holds. The for statement executes a statement or collection of statements for each member of some set (remember that such members can be numerical or non-numerical). Here are some example:

```
for {1..4} {
solve problem1;
let p1[1] := p1[1]+1;
solve problem2;
let p2[1] := p2[1]+1;
}
```

In general, the for statement syntax is:

```
for {i in N} {
...
}
```

In the case of the repeat statement, the iterations continue as long as some logical condition holds. Here is an example:

```
repeat while T[2].dual > 0 {..};
repeat until T[2].dual =0 {..};
repeat {..} while T[2].dual >0 ;
repeat {..} until T[2].dual >0;
```

Here, the loop body is inside the $\}$. All these four statements are different. When the body appears after the while or until statement, the validation of the condition is made before the a pass through the body commands. When the body appears before the while or until the validation is performed after an execution of the body commands.

The while statement repeats while the validation condition holds; on the contrary the until statement repeats while condition is false. In our example, while the dual variable corresponding to
the constraint $\mathrm{T}[2]$ is greater than zero the loop continues. In the until statement, so long as the dual variable corresponding to constraint $\mathrm{T}[2]$ is different from zero, the loop execution continues.

As additional information, the command let is used to change the value of an entity. For example, if you have a flag and you want to update his value to 1 , you just have to type:

```
let flag:= 1;
```


## IF-THEN-ELSE

This statement is used to describe conditional expressions; its general syntax is as follows:

```
if (logicalcondition1) then {
..
}
else if (logical condition2) then {
*
}
else {
}
```

The logical condition is any statement that can be true or false. For example $a<100, b[1]<1$ and $b[2]<1, b[1]<1$ or $b[2]<1$. Note that there is no semicolon (;) after the brackets that enclose the body. The semicolon just follows commands. If the body is a single command you do not need to use brackets.

Above all, we have show all the basic syntax of AMPL for LP, such as set, param, var, minimize/maximize, subject to, let, solve, display, for/repeat, while, until, if else and so on. Some of the previous example is from a tutorial contributed by Tulia Herrera ${ }^{1}$ A detailed description syntax is already include in the bible book of AMPL [4].

## 3 Example: Capacity Expansion Problem

### 3.1 Problem Definition

I will represent an example of stochastic programming. Stochastic programming is a framework for modeling optimization problems that involve uncertainty. Whereas deterministic optimization problems are formulated with known parameters, real world problems almost invariably include some unknown parameters.

The following example is from $\mathrm{ORMM}^{2}$, and it is similar with Example 6.5 [5], but with data assigned.

[^1]A company will supply electricity to three demanders from two electric generators. The unit cost of supplying each customer from each generator site is given below.

Table 7: Transport Cost

| Transportation Cost | Dem. 1 | Dem. 2 | Dem. 3 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Gen. 1 | 4.3 | 2 | 0.5 |
| Gen. 2 | 7.7 | 3 | 1 |

The amounts required by the three demanders is uncertain. Each demand has three levels with amounts and probabilities given below. The probability distributions are independent.

Table 8: Demand and Probability of each Demander

| Demand/Prob | Dem. 1 |  | Dem. 2 |  | Dem. 3 |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Level | $d_{1}$ | $\mathbb{P}\left(d_{1}\right)$ | $d_{2}$ | $\mathbb{P}\left(d_{2}\right)$ | $d_{3}$ | $\mathbb{P}\left(d_{3}\right)$ |
| 1 | 900 | 0.35 | 900 | 0.35 | 900 | 0.35 |
| 2 | 1000 | 0.55 | 1000 | 0.55 | 1100 | 0.55 |
| 3 | 1300 | 0.1 | 1250 | 0.1 | 1400 | 0.1 |

To supply the electricity, the company will install capacity at the two generators. The firststage decisions are $x_{1}$ and $x_{2}$, the installed capacity at the two generators. The unit costs of installed capacity are 400 and 350 at generator 1 and 2 respectively. The total capacity cannot exceed 10,000 .

The reliability of the installed capacity is uncertain. The fractions $f_{1}$ and $f_{2}$ are the proportions of the installed capacity that will actually be available for satisfying demand. There are three levels of reliability as given in the table. These probability distributions are independent. They are also independent of the demand random variables.

The decision maker must select the generator capacity to install before knowing the demand or reliability. The second-stage decisions are the decisions about which demands to service from the generators. In the following $y_{i j}$ is the demand satisfied at customer $j$ from generator $i$. We add a third supplier, Subcontract, to represent demand not met from the generators. The cost can be

Table 9: Reliability and Probability of each generator

| Reliability/Prob | Reliability 1 | Reliability 2 |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Level | $f_{1}$ | $\mathbb{P}\left(f_{1}\right)$ | $f_{2}$ | $\mathbb{P}\left(f_{2}\right)$ |
| 1 | 1 | 0.9 | 1 | 0.85 |
| 2 | 0.95 | 0.05 | 0.8 | 0.1 |
| 3 | 0.3 | 0.05 | 0 | 0.05 |

Table 10: transportation model

| Transport Cost | Dem. 1 | Dem. 2 | Dem. 3 | Supply |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Gen. 1 | 4.3 | 2 | 0.5 | $f_{1} x_{1}$ |
| Gen. 2 | 7.7 | 3 | 1 | $f_{2} x_{2}$ |
| Subcontract | 6000 | 6000 | 6000 | no limit |
| Demand | $d_{1}$ | $d_{2}$ | $d_{3}$ |  |

viewed as a penalty cost or as the cost of satisfying the demand through a subcontractor.
The problem has the form of a transportation model as shown below with random variables and decisions affecting the supplies and demands.

The transportation model cannot be immediately solved because its parameters depend on five random variables and two decisions determined elsewhere.

Before we get deep into our model, one thing need to point out is the size of the problem. If we have three demand types, three different levels(parts) and each generator has three different reliabilities, the scenarios in such kind of model will become $3^{3} \times 3^{2}=243$. And the total variables in our model will be 2189 and the total constraints will be 1216. If you plug into the AMPL student version, it will output the following statement:

```
Sorry, the student edition of AMPL is limited to 500 variables
and 500 constraints and objectives (after presolve) for linear
problems. You have 2189 variables, 1216 constraints, and 1 objective.
```

Thus I assume that the reliability is fixed to 1 , which there is no random variable related to that. As showed in Table 9, I fix the $f_{i}=1$ with $\mathbb{P}\left(f_{i}\right)=1$. After the simplification, the model will become much smaller that before. 27 scenarios, $27^{*} 9+2=245$ variables and $27^{*} 5+1=136$ constraints.

### 3.2 Model Definition

Let's define $x_{i}$ be the capacity installed in generator $i$, let $y_{i j}^{s}$ be the amount transposed from generator $i$ to demander $j$ at scenario $s$, let $z_{j}$ be the capacity transfered from subcontract to demander $j$ at scenario $s$.

And also let $c_{i}$ be the parameter of installation cost of each generator; let $\mathbb{P}(s)$ be the probability of scenario s, which is a Cartesian product of probabilities of three demanders in three levels; let $g_{j}$ be the cost of transpose from subcontract to demand $j$, which is fixed 6000 in this example. The
problem can be formed as:

$$
\begin{aligned}
\min \quad & \sum_{i=1}^{2} c_{i} x_{i}
\end{aligned}+\sum_{s \in S} \mathbb{P}(s)\left[\sum_{i=1}^{2} \sum_{j=1}^{3}\left(f_{i j} y_{i j}^{s}+g_{j} z_{j}^{s}\right)\right]
$$

### 3.3 Transfer into AMPL

A proper way of programming with AMPL is to figure out all the parameters, variables, objective and constraints. Here are steps you can follow to get hand on AMPL:

1. Identify the variables in the model. In this example $\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{y}, \mathbf{z}$ are the variables.
2. Identify the indices of each variable, understand what those mean. For example, $x_{i}$ where $i$ is the index of generator; $y_{i j}^{s}$ where $i$ is the index of generator, $j$ is the index of demander and $s$ is the index of scenario.
3. Identify the set involved in the model, and define them at .mod file. In this example generator, demander and scenario are three main set in our problem.
4. Write down the parameter, variable declaration in. $\bmod$ file according to the set already defined.
5. Write down problem objective and constraint. Taking advantage of set you defined, just write down the form of each constraint, especially constraints with $\forall$ in it. For example:
```
# constraint of suppling from generators must
# larger than it distributed to demander
s.t. supply_constraint {g in Generator, s in Scenarios}:
    sum {d in Demander} y[g, d, s] <= x[g];
```

indicate the second constraint of the problem for all $j$ and $s$.
6. Assign data to parameters and sets.
7. Write down a command(.run) file, which include both model and data files, and set proper options, display options, and reset data if need.

A detailed implementation and commands can be found in Appendix 2.
For this problem we can get the optimal cost is 1277842.605 with $\mathbf{x}=(0,3400)$ decision made at the first stage. In the simplified problem, since the transport costs of first generator are larger then the second one, it makes sense that set the second one into a certain amount. For the second stage, if extra demand needed, transpose from subcontract. Such scenario has much lower probability.

## 4 Summarization

This is a simple tutorial of AMPL. At the end of the tutorial, you should already know how to build a mathematical model using AMPL, and solve it. A lot of advanced topics of AMPL are not covered in the report, such as compound data specification, data access from database, network programming, piecewise LP and nonlinear programming. Besides, solver, like CPLEX, has its own features, it can work be separated from AMPL, and using other modeling language, such as GAMS. It also has features like analysis of problems, presolve problem, duality analysis and so on.

Besides our textbook [5], for quick study of LP, you can refer a textbook contributed by Matoušek, Jiří and Gärtner, Bernd [6]; for applications and algorithms of operation research, you can refer a book contributed by Winston [7]; for typical models of optimization, you can refer a book written by Jensen [8], and also available online https://www.me.utexas.edu/~jensen/ORMM/. For detailed syntax of AMPL, check its book online http://www.ampl.com/BOOK/, it is free for download.

## References

[1] NEOS. Neos statistics. http://www.neos-server.org/neos/, June 2014.
[2] AMPL. All solvers for ampl. http://ampl.com/products/solvers/all-solvers-for-ampl/, June 2014.
[3] AMPL. Try ampl! http://www.ampl.com/TRYAMPL/startup.html, June 2014.
[4] Rober Fourer, D Gay, and Brian W Kernighan. A Mathematical Programming Language (Second Edition). Duxbury Press, Pacific Grove, 2002.
[5] Dimitris Bertsimas and John N Tsitsiklis. Introduction to linear optimization. 1997.
[6] Jiří Matoušek and Bernd Gärtner. Understanding and using linear programming, volume 168. Springer, 2007.
[7] Wayne L Winston and Jeffrey B Goldberg. Operations research: applications and algorithms. 1994.
[8] Paul A Jensen and Jonathan F Bard. Operations research models and methods. John Wiley \& Sons Incorporated, 2003.

## Appendix 1: Step by Step Setting up AMPL(student edition)

The following steps are working for Windows systems.
Step 1: Download the resource from http://ampl.com/dl/demo/ampl-demo-mswin.zip.
Step 2: Unzip it into a directory you want to install, for example in the desktop. Now you will see a list of files and directories. In my example:

| Directory of C:\Users \Hongwei Jin \Desktop\ampl-demo-mswin \ampl-demo |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 04/30/2014 | 01:19 |  | <DIR> | . |
| 04/30/2014 | 01:19 |  | <DIR> |  |
| 02/21/2014 | 03:52 |  | 868,352 | ampl.exe |
| 02/21/2014 | 03:52 |  | 94,208 | ampltabl.dll |
| 02/21/2014 | 03:52 |  | 362,496 | plex.exe |
| 02/21/2014 | 03:52 |  | 13,430,784 | cplex1260.dll |
| 02/21/2014 | 03:52 | PM | 5,932 | exhelp32.exe |
| 02/21/2014 | 03:52 |  | 233,472 | gurobi.exe |
| 02/21/2014 | 03:52 |  | 8, 241,672 | gurobi56.dll |
| 02/21/2014 | 03:52 | PM |  | kestrelkill |
| 02/21/2014 | 03:52 | PM |  | kestrelret |
| 02/21/2014 | 03:52 |  |  | kestrelsub |
| 02/21/2014 | 03:52 | PM | 3,213 | LICENSE.txt |
| 02/21/2014 | 03:52 | PM | 188,416 | lpsolve.exe |
| 02/21/2014 | 03:52 |  | 393,216 | minos.exe |
| 04/30/2014 | 01:19 | AM | <DIR> | MODELS |
| 02/21/2014 | 03:52 | PM |  | modinc |
| 02/21/2014 | 03:52 | PM | 4,415 | README |
| 02/21/2014 | 03:52 | PM | 88, 054 | README.cplex.txt |
| 02/21/2014 | 03:52 | PM | 4,780 | README.gurobi.txt |
| 02/21/2014 | 03:52 |  | 12,736 | readme.sw |
| 02/21/2014 | 03:52 |  | 69,632 | sw.exe |
| 04/30/2014 | 01:19 |  | <DIR> | TABLES |
|  | 19 | File(s) | 24,001,618 | bytes |
|  | 4 | ir (s) | 55,729,176,576 | bytes free |

Notice besides the ampl application, it also include student edition solvers, such as cplex, gurobi, lpsolve, minos. If you have other solvers just put the executable file in the same directory. Subdirectories include all example in the AMPL book [4]. It is a fast way to get started.

Step 3: Use Windows CMD.exe get to the directory of AMPL, type ampl modinc -:

```
C:\Users\Hongwei Jin\Desktop\ampl-demo-mswin\ampl-demo>ampl modinc -
ampl:
```

You will see AMPL is running.
Step 4: Example Test. You can try examples in the sub-directory, since you already include the sub-directories by ampl modinc -, you can type in AMPL to specify model and data and to solve. One example will be the following:

```
ampl: model prod.mod;
ampl: data prod.dat;
ampl: solve;
MINOS 5.5: optimal solution found.
2 iterations, objective 192000
ampl: display _varname, _var;
    _varname _var :=
    "X['bands']" }600
    "X['coils']" }140
```

Step 5: Basically, you can run AMPL to solve problem by step 4, however, it is tedious to get into that directory every time. You can add this directory path into your system path environment such that you can run AMPL any where. But if you need to run examples, you need to get into this directory.

Commends:
$>$ Download source from netlib are almost the same, the only different is you need to download AMPL and solver one by one and extract them into a same directory.
> Other systems are just similar with Windows. But if you have a 64 bit Linux system, you wouldn't able to run AMPL. What you need to do is install a 32 bit support lib, named libc6-i386, after that make AMPL executable by

```
hjin15@hjin15-mint ~/ampl/ampl-demo/ampl $ chmod x ampl
hjin15@hjin15-mint ~/ampl/ampl-demo/ampl $ ./ampl modinc -
ampl:
```

> A GLPK (GNU Linear Programming Kit) is available for Linux systems. It can work with AMPL as well. Define a model file:

```
# short.mod
var x1;
var x2;
maximize obj: 0.6 * x1 + 0.5 * x2;
s.t. c1: x1 + 2 * x2 <= 1;
s.t. c2: 3 * x1 + x2 <= 2;
solve;
display x1, x2;
end;
```

Install GLPK on Linux system, it usually called: glpk-utils. After that you can solve this short model by using glpk as well.

```
hjin15@hjin15-mint ~ $ glpsol --math short.mod
GLPSOL: GLPK LP/MIP Solver, v4.45
```

```
Parameter(s) specified in the command line:
    --math short.mod
Reading model section from short.mod...
9 lines were read
Generating obj...
Generating c1...
Generating c2...
Model has been successfully generated
GLPK Simplex Optimizer, v4.45
3 rows, 2 columns, 6 non-zeros
Preprocessing...
2 rows, 2 columns, 4 non-zeros
Scaling...
    A: min|aij| = 1.000e+00 max|aij| = 3.000e+00 ratio = 3.000e+00
Problem data seem to be well scaled
Constructing initial basis...
Size of triangular part = 2
* 0: obj = 0.000000000e+00 infeas = 0.000e+00 (0)
* 2: obj = 4.600000000e-01 infeas = 0.000e+00 (0)
OPTIMAL SOLUTION FOUND
Time used: 0.0 secs
Memory used: 0.1 Mb (114811 bytes)
Display statement at line 8
x1.val = 0.6
x2.val = 0.2
Model has been successfully processed
```

where -math indicate that the model is described by AMPL.

## Appendix 2: Capacity Expansion Problem Implementation(simplified one)

## Model Declaration (capa.mod):

```
## this is a model file
# declaration of set, parameters, variables, problem and constraints.
model;
# define sets of generators and demanders
set Generator;
set Demander;
# define the set of scenarios, fixed to 3^3 in this example
set Scenarios := {1..27};
# declare the parameter of f_{ij}
param COST {g in Generator, d in Demander};
# declare the parameter of c_i
param INSTALLATION_COST {g in Generator};
# declare the probability of scenarios P(s)
param SCENARIOS_PROB {s in Scenarios};
# declare the demand
param DEMAND{s in Scenarios, d in Demander};
# for stage 1, capacity installed in generators 1 & 2;
var x {g in Generator} >= 0, suffix stage 1;
# for stage 2, capacity transfered from genertors g
# to demander d at scenario s;
var y {g in Generator, d in Demander, s in Scenarios} >= 0, suffix stage 2;
# for stage 2, if necessary, transfer subcounter to demander d;
var z {d in Demander, s in Scenarios} >= 0, suffix stage 2;
# define the objective, sum both stages cost.
minimize total_cost :
        sum {g in Generator} x[g] * INSTALLATION_COST[g] +
        sum {g in Generator, d in Demander, s in Scenarios}
            SCENARIOS_PROB[s]*(y[g, d, s]* COST[g, d] + z[d, s]*6000);
    constraint of total capacity
```

```
s.t. total_capacity :
    sum {g in Generator} x[g] <=10000;
# constraint of suppling from generators must larger than it distributed to demander
s.t. supply_constraint {g in Generator, s in Scenarios}:
    sum {d in Demander} y[g, d, s] <= x[g];
# for each demander, either from generator or subcontract must meet the requirement
s.t. demand_constraint {d in Demander, s in Scenarios}:
    sum {g in Generator} y[g, d, s] + z[d, s]>= DEMAND[s, d];
```


## Data specification (capa.dat)

```
## this is a data file
# set all the data according to the variables.
data;
set Generator := g1 g2;
set Demander := d1 d2 d3;
param COST:
\begin{tabular}{llll} 
& \(d 1\) & \(d 2\) \\
g1 & \begin{tabular}{ll} 
d
\end{tabular} \\
\hline & 4.3 & 2 & 0.5
\end{tabular}
param INSTALLATION_COST :=
    g1 400
    g2 350;
# The probability is calculated by Cartesian product of three
# different demander's probability.
param SCENARIOS_PROB :=
    1 0.042875
    2 0.067375
    3 0.01225
    4 0.067375
    5 0.105875
    6 0.01925
    7 0.01225
    8 0.01925
    9 0.0035
    10 0.067375
    11 0.105875
    12 0.01925
    13 0.105875
    14 0.166375
```



## Command file (capa.run)

```
## this is a command file
# reset all the previous parameters variable and data.
reset;
# include model and data file
include capa.mod;
include capa.dat;
# show running time
option times 1;
# show model statistics, variable number, constraint number etc.
option show_stats 1;
# set solver option
option solver cplex;
# presolve the problem to reduce the number of constriants
option presolve 1;
solve;
# show objective value
display _obj;
# show variable value, stage, reduced cost,
display _varname, _var, _var.stage, _var.rc;
```


## Display output:

| \# |  | incremental | total |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| \#phase | seconds | memory | memory |
| \#execute | 0.0156001 | 275512 | 275512 |
| \#execute | 0 | 0 | 275512 |
| \#execute | 0 | 0 | 275512 |
| \#execute | 0 | 0 | 275512 |
| \#compile | 0 | 0 | 275512 |
| \# genmod | 0 | 75648 | 351160 |
| \#merge | 0 | 2056 | 353216 |
| \#collect | 0 | 15432 | 368648 |
| 245 variables, all linear |  |  |  |
| 136 constraints, all linear; 461 nonzeros |  |  |  |
| 136 inequality constraints |  |  |  |
| 1 linear objective; 245 nonzeros. |  |  |  |
| \#presolve | 0 | 34848 | 403496 |
| \#output | 0 | 0 | 403496 |
| CPLEX 12.6.0.0: | \#Total | 0.0156001 |  |


| 163 dual simplex iterations (0 in phase I)    <br> \#execute 0.0156001 6704 410200 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| _obj [*] : $=$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 11277840 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| ; |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| \#execute 0 |  |  | 4624 | 41482 |  |  |
| \#\#\# E:\Dropbox\GitHub \AMPL-project\draft/capa.run:23(511) display |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| : | _varname | _var | _var.stage | _var.rc | _var.dual | : $=$ |
| 1 | "x['g1']" | 0 | 1 | 46.6 | 0 |  |
| 2 | "x['g2']" | 3400 | 1 | 0 | 0 |  |
| 3 | "y['g1', 'd1', 1 ] " | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 |  |
| 4 | "y['g1', 'd1', 2] " | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 |  |
| 5 | "y['g1', 'd1', 3] " | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 |  |
| 6 | "y['g1', 'd1',4] " | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 |  |
| 7 | "y['g1', 'd1', 5] " | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 |  |
| 8 | "y['g1 ', 'd1', 6] " | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 |  |
| 9 | "y['g1', 'd1', 7 ] " | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 |  |
| 10 | "y['g1', 'd1', 8] " | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 |  |
| 11 | "y['g1', 'd1', 9 ] " | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 |  |
| 12 | "y['g1', 'd1', 10] " | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 |  |
| 13 | "y['g1', 'd1 ', 11] " | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 |  |
| 14 | "y['g1', 'd1', 12] " | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 |  |
| 15 | "y['g1', 'd1', 13] " | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 |  |
| 16 | "y['g1', 'd1 ', 14] " | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 |  |
| 17 | "y['g1', 'd1', 15] " | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 |  |
| 18 | "y['g1', 'd1 ', 16] " | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 |  |
| 19 | "y['g1', 'd1', 17] " | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 |  |
| 20 | "y ['g1', 'd1', 18] " | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 |  |
| 21 | "y['g1', 'd1 ', 19] " | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 |  |
| 22 | "y['g1', 'd1 ', 20] " | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 |  |
| 23 | "y['g1', 'd1', 21] " | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 |  |
| 24 | "y['g1', 'd1', 22] " | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 |  |
| 25 | "y['g1', 'd1', 23] " | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 |  |
| 26 | "y['g1', 'd1', 24] " | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 |  |
| 27 | "y['g1', 'd1 ', 25] " | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 |  |
| 28 | "y['g1', 'd1 ', 26] " | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 |  |
| 29 | "y['g1', 'd1', 27] " | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 |  |
| 30 | "y['g1', 'd2', 1] " | 0 | 2 | 0.1029 | 0 |  |
| 31 | "y['g1', 'd2',2] " | 0 | 2 | 0.1617 | 0 |  |
| 32 | "y['g1', 'd2', 3] " | 0 | 2 | 0.0294 | 0 |  |
| 33 | "y['g1', 'd2',4] " | 0 | 2 | 0.1617 | 0 |  |
| 34 | "y['g1', 'd2', 5] " | 0 | 2 | 0.2541 | 0 |  |
| 35 | "y['g1', 'd2', 6] " | 0 | 2 | 0.0462 | 0 |  |
| 36 | "y['g1', 'd2', 7 ] " | 0 | 2 | 0.0294 | 0 |  |


| 37 | "y['g1', 'd2', 8] " | 0 | 2 | 0.0462 | 0 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 38 | "y['g1', 'd2', 9] " | 0 | 2 | 0.0084 | 0 |
| 39 | "y['g1', 'd2', 10] " | 0 | 2 | 0.1617 | 0 |
| 40 | "y['g1', 'd2', 11] " | 0 | 2 | 0.2541 | 0 |
| 41 | "y['g1', 'd2', 12] " | 0 | 2 | 0.0462 | 0 |
| 42 | "y['g1', 'd2 ', 13] " | 0 | 2 | 0.2541 | 0 |
| 43 | "y['g1', 'd2 ', 14] " | 0 | 2 | 0.3993 | 0 |
| 44 | "y['g1', 'd2 ', 15] " | 0 | 2 | 0.0726 | 0 |
| 45 | "y['g1', 'd2 ', 16] " | 0 | 2 | 0.0462 | 0 |
| 46 | "y['g1', 'd2', 17] " | 0 | 2 | 0.0726 | 0 |
| 47 | "y['g1', 'd2 ', 18] " | 0 | 2 | 0.0132 | 0 |
| 48 | "y['g1', 'd2 ', 19] " | 0 | 2 | 0.0294 | 0 |
| 49 | "y['g1', 'd2', 20] " | 0 | 2 | 0.0462 | 0 |
| 50 | "y['g1', 'd2', 21] " | 0 | 2 | 0.0084 | 0 |
| 51 | "y['g1', 'd2 ', 22] " | 0 | 2 | 0.0462 | 0 |
| 52 | "y['g1', 'd2 ', 23] " | 0 | 2 | 0.0726 | 0 |
| 53 | "y['g1', 'd2 ', 24] " | 0 | 2 | 0.0132 | 0 |
| 54 | "y['g1', 'd2', 25] " | 0 | 2 | 0.0084 | 0 |
| 55 | "y['g1', 'd2', 26] " | 0 | 2 | 0.0132 | 0 |
| 56 | "y['g1', 'd2 ', 27] " | 0 | 2 | 0.0024 | 0 |
| 57 | "y['g1', 'd3', 1] " | 0 | 2 | 0.124338 | 0 |
| 58 | "y['g1', 'd3', 2] " | 0 | 2 | 0.195388 | 0 |
| 59 | "y['g1', 'd3', 3] " | 0 | 2 | 0.035525 | 0 |
| 60 | "y['g1', 'd3', 4] " | 0 | 2 | 0.195388 | 0 |
| 61 | "y['g1', 'd3', 5] " | 0 | 2 | 0.307038 | 0 |
| 62 | "y['g1', 'd3', 6] " | 0 | 2 | 0.055825 | 0 |
| 63 | "y['g1', 'd3', 7] " | 0 | 2 | 0.035525 | 0 |
| 64 | "y['g1', 'd3', 8] " | 0 | 2 | 0.055825 | 0 |
| 65 | "y['g1', 'd3', 9] " | 0 | 2 | 0.01015 | 0 |
| 66 | "y['g1', 'd3 ', 10] " | 0 | 2 | 0.195388 | 0 |
| 67 | "y['g1', 'd3 ', 11] " | 0 | 2 | 0.307038 | 0 |
| 68 | "y['g1', 'd3 ', 12] " | 0 | 2 | 0.055825 | 0 |
| 69 | "y['g1', 'd3 ', 13] " | 0 | 2 | 0.307038 | 0 |
| 70 | "y['g1', 'd3 ', 14] " | 0 | 2 | 0.482488 | 0 |
| 71 | "y['g1', 'd3 ', 15] " | 0 | 2 | 0.087725 | 0 |
| 72 | "y['g1', 'd3 ', 16] " | 0 | 2 | 0.055825 | 0 |
| 73 | "y['g1', 'd3 ', 17] " | 0 | 2 | 0.087725 | 0 |
| 74 | "y['g1', 'd3 ', 18] " | 0 | 2 | 0.01595 | 0 |
| 75 | "y['g1', 'd3 ', 19] " | 0 | 2 | 0.035525 | 0 |
| 76 | "y['g1', 'd3 ', 20] " | 0 | 2 | 0.055825 | 0 |
| 77 | "y['g1', 'd3 ', 21] " | 0 | 2 | 0.01015 | 0 |
| 78 | "y['g1', 'd3 ', 22] " | 0 | 2 | 0.055825 | 0 |
| 79 | "y['g1', 'd3', 23] " | 0 | 2 | 0.087725 | 0 |
| 80 | "y['g1', 'd3 ', 24] " | 0 | 2 | 0.01595 | 0 |
| 81 | "y['g1', 'd3 ', 25] " | 0 | 2 | 0.01015 | 0 |
| 82 | "y['g1', 'd3 ', 26] " | 0 | 2 | 0.01595 | 0 |
| 83 | "y['g1', 'd3',27] " | 0 | 2 | 0.0029 | 0 |


| 84 | "y['g2', 'd1', 1] " | 900 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 85 | "y['g2', 'd1', 2] " | 900 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 86 | "y['g2', 'd1', 3] " | 900 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 87 | "y['g2', 'd1', 4] " | 900 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 88 | "y['g2', 'd1', 5] " | 900 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 89 | "y['g2', 'd1',6]" | 900 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 90 | "y['g2', 'd1', 7] " | 900 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 91 | "y['g2', 'd1', 8] " | 900 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 92 | "y['g2', 'd1', 9] " | 750 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 93 | "y['g2', 'd1', 10] " | 1000 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 94 | "y['g2', 'd1 ', 11] " | 1000 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 95 | "y['g2', 'd1 ', 12] " | 1000 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 96 | "y['g2', 'd1 ', 13] " | 1000 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 97 | "y['g2', 'd1 ', 14] " | 1000 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 98 | "y['g2', 'd1 ', 15] " | 1000 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 99 | "y['g2', 'd1 ', 16] " | 1000 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 100 | "y['g2', 'd1 ', 17] " | 1000 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 101 | "y['g2', 'd1 ', 18] " | 750 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 102 | "y['g2', 'd1 ', 19] " | 1300 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 103 | "y['g2', 'd1 ', 20] " | 1300 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 104 | "y['g2', 'd1 ', 21] " | 1100 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 105 | "y['g2', 'd1 ', 22] " | 1300 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 106 | "y['g2', 'd1 ', 23] " | 1300 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 107 | "y['g2', 'd1 ', 24] " | 1000 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 108 | "y['g2', 'd1 ', 25] " | 1250 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 109 | "y['g2', 'd1 ', 26] " | 1050 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 110 | "y['g2', 'd1 ', 27] " | 750 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 111 | "y['g2', 'd2', 1] " | 900 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 112 | "y['g2', 'd2', 2] " | 900 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 113 | "y['g2', 'd2',3] " | 900 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 114 | "y['g2', 'd2', 4] " | 1000 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 115 | "y['g2', 'd2', 5] " | 1000 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 116 | "y['g2', 'd2',6]" | 1000 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 117 | "y['g2', 'd2', 7] " | 1250 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 118 | "y['g2', 'd2', 8] " | 1250 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 119 | "y['g2', 'd2', 9] " | 1250 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 120 | "y['g2', 'd2 ', 10] " | 900 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 121 | "y['g2', 'd2 ', 11] " | 900 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 122 | "y['g2', 'd2 ', 12] " | 900 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 123 | "y['g2', 'd2 ', 13] " | 1000 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 124 | "y['g2', 'd2 ', 14] " | 1000 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 125 | "y['g2', 'd2 ', 15] " | 1000 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 126 | "y['g2', 'd2 ', 16] " | 1250 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 127 | "y['g2', 'd2 ', 17] " | 1250 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 128 | "y['g2', 'd2 ', 18] " | 1250 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 129 | "y['g2', 'd2 ', 19] " | 900 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 130 | "y['g2', 'd2', 20] " | 900 | 2 | 0 | 0 |


| 131 | "y['g2 ', 'd2 ', 21] " | 900 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 132 | "y['g2', 'd2', 22] " | 1000 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 133 | "y['g2 ', 'd2 ', 23] " | 1000 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 134 | "y['g2', 'd2 ', 24] " | 1000 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 135 | "y['g2', 'd2', 25] " | 1250 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 136 | "y['g2', 'd2 ', 26] " | 1250 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 137 | "y['g2 , ' $\mathrm{d} 2^{\prime}$ ', 27] " | 1250 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 138 | "y['g2', 'd3', 1] " | 900 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 139 | "y['g2', 'd3', 2] " | 1100 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 140 | "y['g2', 'd3',3] " | 1400 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 141 | "y['g2', 'd3', 4] " | 900 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 142 | "y['g2 ', 'd3', 5] " | 1100 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 143 | "y['g2', 'd3', 6] " | 1400 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 144 | "y['g2 ', 'd3', 7] " | 900 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 145 | "y['g2', 'd3', 8] " | 1100 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 146 | "y['g2', 'd3', 9] " | 1400 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 147 | "y ['g2', 'd3 ', 10] " | 900 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 148 | "y ['g2', 'd3 ', 11] " | 1100 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 149 | "y['g2', 'd3 ', 12] " | 1400 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 150 | "y ['g2', 'd3 ', 13] " | 900 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 151 | "y ['g2', 'd3 ', 14] " | 1100 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 152 | "y['g2', 'd3 ', 15] " | 1400 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 153 | "y['g2', 'd3 ', 16] " | 900 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 154 | "y ['g2 ', 'd3 ', 17] " | 1100 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 155 | "y ['g2 ', 'd3 ', 18] " | 1400 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 156 | "y ['g2', 'd3 ', 19] " | 900 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 157 | "y ['g2', 'd3', 20] " | 1100 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 158 | "y['g2', 'd3 ', 21] " | 1400 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 159 | "y['g2 ', 'd3 ', 22] " | 900 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 160 | "y ['g2', 'd3 ', 23] " | 1100 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 161 | "y['g2', 'd3', 24] " | 1400 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 162 | "y ['g2', 'd3 ', 25] " | 900 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 163 | "y['g2', 'd3 ', 26] " | 1100 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 164 | "y ['g2', 'd3 ', 27] " | 1400 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 165 | "z['d1', 1] " | 0 | 2 | 514.17 | 0 |
| 166 | "z['d1', 2] " | 0 | 2 | 807.981 | 0 |
| 167 | "z['d1', 3] " | 0 | 2 | 146.906 | 0 |
| 168 | "z['d1', 4] " | 0 | 2 | 807.981 | 0 |
| 169 | "z['d1', 5] " | 0 | 2 | 1269.68 | 0 |
| 170 | "z['d1', 6] " | 0 | 2 | 230.852 | 0 |
| 171 | "z['d1', 7 ] " | 0 | 2 | 146.906 | 0 |
| 172 | "z['d1', 8] " | 0 | 2 | 230.852 | 0 |
| 173 | "z['d1', 9] " | 150 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 174 | "z['d1', 10] " | 0 | 2 | 807.981 | 0 |
| 175 | "z['d1', 11] " | 0 | 2 | 1269.68 | 0 |
| 176 | "z['d1', 12] " | 0 | 2 | 230.852 | 0 |
| 177 | "z['d1', 13] " | 0 | 2 | 1269.68 | 0 |


| 178 | "z['d1', 14] " | 0 | 2 | 1995.22 | 0 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 179 | "z['d1', 15] " | 0 | 2 | 348.551 | 0 |
| 180 | "z['d1', 16] " | 0 | 2 | 230.852 | 0 |
| 181 | "z['d1', 17] " | 0 | 2 | 362.767 | 0 |
| 182 | "z['d1', 18] " | 250 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 183 | "z['d1', 19] " | 0 | 2 | 146.906 | 0 |
| 184 | "z['d1', 20] " | 0 | 2 | 230.852 | 0 |
| 185 | "z['d1', 21] " | 200 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 186 | "z['d1', 22] " | 0 | 2 | 230.852 | 0 |
| 187 | "z['d1', 23] " | 0 | 2 | 362.767 | 0 |
| 188 | "z['d1', 24] " | 300 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 189 | "z['d1', 25] " | 50 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 190 | "z['d1', 26] " | 250 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 191 | "z['d1', 27] " | 550 | 2 | 0 | 0 |
| 192 | "z['d2', 1] " | 0 | 2 | 514.371 | 0 |
| 193 | "z['d2', 2] " | 0 | 2 | 808.298 | 0 |
| 194 | "z['d2', 3] " | 0 | 2 | 146.963 | 0 |
| 195 | "z['d2', 4]" | 0 | 2 | 808.298 | 0 |
| 196 | "z['d2', 5] " | 0 | 2 | 1270.18 | 0 |
| 197 | "z['d2', 6] " | 0 | 2 | 230.942 | 0 |
| 198 | "z['d2', 7 ] " | 0 | 2 | 146.963 | 0 |
| 199 | "z['d2', 8] " | 0 | 2 | 230.942 | 0 |
| 200 | "z['d2', 9] " | 0 | 2 | 0.01645 | 0 |
| 201 | "z['d2', 10] " | 0 | 2 | 808.298 | 0 |
| 202 | "z['d2', 11] " | 0 | 2 | 1270.18 | 0 |
| 203 | "z['d2', 12] " | 0 | 2 | 230.942 | 0 |
| 204 | "z['d2', 13] " | 0 | 2 | 1270.18 | 0 |
| 205 | "z['d2', 14] " | 0 | 2 | 1996 | 0 |
| 206 | "z['d2', 15] " | 0 | 2 | 348.694 | 0 |
| 207 | "z['d2', 16] " | 0 | 2 | 230.942 | 0 |
| 208 | "z['d2 ', 17] " | 0 | 2 | 362.909 | 0 |
| 209 | "z['d2', 18] " | 0 | 2 | 0.02585 | 0 |
| 210 | "z['d2 ', 19] " | 0 | 2 | 146.963 | 0 |
| 211 | "z['d2 ', 20] " | 0 | 2 | 230.942 | 0 |
| 212 | "z['d2', 21] " | 0 | 2 | 0.01645 | 0 |
| 213 | "z['d2', 22] " | 0 | 2 | 230.942 | 0 |
| 214 | "z['d2', 23] " | 0 | 2 | 362.909 | 0 |
| 215 | "z['d2', 24] " | 0 | 2 | 0.02585 | 0 |
| 216 | "z['d2', 25] " | 0 | 2 | 0.01645 | 0 |
| 217 | "z['d2', 26] " | 0 | 2 | 0.02585 | 0 |
| 218 | "z['d2', 27] " | 0 | 2 | 0.0047 | 0 |
| 219 | "z['d3', 1] " | 0 | 2 | 514.457 | 0 |
| 220 | "z['d3', 2] " | 0 | 2 | 808.433 | 0 |
| 221 | "z['d3', 3] " | 0 | 2 | 146.988 | 0 |
| 222 | "z['d3', 4] " | 0 | 2 | 808.433 | 0 |
| 223 | "z['d3', 5] " | 0 | 2 | 1270.39 | 0 |
| 224 | "z['d3', 6] " | 0 | 2 | 230.981 | 0 |


| 225 | "z['d3', 7] " | 0 | 2 | 146.988 | 0 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 226 | "z['d3', 8] " | 0 | 2 | 230.981 | 0 |
| 227 | "z['d3', 9] " | 0 | 2 | 0.02345 | 0 |
| 228 | "z['d3', 10] " | 0 | 2 | 808.433 | 0 |
| 229 | "z['d3', 11] " | 0 | 2 | 1270.39 | 0 |
| 230 | "z['d3', 12] " | 0 | 2 | 230.981 | 0 |
| 231 | "z['d3', 13] " | 0 | 2 | 1270.39 | 0 |
| 232 | "z['d3', 14] " | 0 | 2 | 1996.33 | 0 |
| 233 | "z['d3', 15] " | 0 | 2 | 348.754 | 0 |
| 234 | "z['d3', 16] " | 0 | 2 | 230.981 | 0 |
| 235 | "z['d3', 17] " | 0 | 2 | 362.97 | 0 |
| 236 | "z['d3', 18] " | 0 | 2 | 0.03685 | 0 |
| 237 | "z['d3', 19] " | 0 | 2 | 146.988 | 0 |
| 238 | "z['d3', 20] " | 0 | 2 | 230.981 | 0 |
| 239 | "z['d3', 21] " | 0 | 2 | 0.02345 | 0 |
| 240 | "z['d3', 22] " | 0 | 2 | 230.981 | 0 |
| 241 | "z['d3', 23] " | 0 | 2 | 362.97 | 0 |
| 242 | "z['d3', 24] " | 0 | 2 | 0.03685 | 0 |
| 243 | "z['d3 ', 25] " | 0 | 2 | 0.02345 | 0 |
| 244 | "z['d3', 26] " | 0 | 2 | 0.03685 | 0 |
| 245 | "z['d3', 27] " | 0 | 2 | 0.0067 | 0 |
| ; |  |  |  |  |  |
| \#ex | ute $0$ |  |  | 445112 |  |


[^0]:    ${ }^{1}$ GLPK - GNU Linear Programming Kit: http://www.gnu.org/software/glpk/

[^1]:    ${ }^{1}$ AMPL Tutorial: http://www.columbia.edu/~dano/courses/4600/lectures/6/AMPLTutorialV2.pdf
    ${ }^{2}$ Operation Research Models and Methods - Stochastic Programming: https://www.me.utexas.edu/~jensen/ ORMM/computation/unit/mp_add/subunits/stochastic/capacity.html

